| **Student Name:** Chester Tam |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the narrative that sacrifice is necessary for achieving one's dreams |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  We should start with a high impact opening that spells out why exactly we oppose this narrative.  Set-up   * Good work defining sacrifice - give me an example of what this looks like. Good on studying and free time - but this seems like a pretty reasonable sacrifice to make. We should characterise this as having higher stakes - so for instance how this narrative contributes to the glorification of suffering or pain in the process of achieving our goals. * Good use of examples to ground what this looks like! * Build this out more persuasively - explain how people feel obligated to engage in sacrifice because they think it is necessary. * Is the push of this debate to develop lots of skills, or that this leads people to think sacrifice is needed/make sacrifices where it isn’t necessary? * You should push the counterfactual of a balanced approach that prioritizes well-being and enjoyment is more sustainable and ultimately more likely to lead to success.   Argument 1   * Is this exclusive to the round? Or are there other incentives for people to develop skills outside of this narrative? * What kinds of decisions do people make and how is this bad and what we do not want on our side?   Argument 2   * This argument impacts the lack of balance - this impact should be part of the first argument. * Don’t make up examples to use as arguments! We should be a little bit more realistic with our analysis. * Good on what you can do in the counterfactual.   We need to identify the in and of itself narrative; explain why the lack of truth has bad impacts; for instance, that it misleads people or makes them blame themselves when even if they work hard and sacrifice they cannot succeed.  You need to spend time characterising the way in which this narrative impacts people in the status quo to pinpoint what the problem characterisation is. Is it that people make bad decisions, or they glorify suffering because they think this is just part of the process? Prove that this narrative leads to burnout, resentment, and an unhealthy obsession with the end goal.  We could have also spent time explaining how this narrative convinces people that their dreams have very high costs and hence should not even pursue them in the first place. We can also argue how this narrative disproportionately hurts the underprivileged - people are led to believe equal amounts of sacrifice go in, but how true is this?  05:08 - we need to ask POIs! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Emilia Lau |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the narrative that sacrifice is necessary for achieving one's dreams. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good work attacking this concept of balance. Explain how this problem is unaffected by this debate.  Set-up   * You need to re-characterise this narrative to explain why it isn’t as bad as Prop claims. You have to establish how this narrative is mitigated by and balanced out through other narratives, such as those of mental health, the glamorisation of start-up culture, more class consciousness etc. * We need to explain why this **narrative** is what is necessary for people to be able to make better decisions. Why would they not make good decisions without it? Why do we need this narrative to exist? * What even is a dream? Is this about reasonable goals and desires, or really wild outlandish dreams and such? * Don’t do set-up aimlessly - focus on the strongest points, and then move on! Remember that this is a 5 minute speech.   Rebuttal   * You only need to point out how balance is dealt with really easily by the existence of counter-narratives/why this is outside the parameters of the debate. Engage and then move on!   Argument 1   * You could have easily argued that people rush into making decisions, and that this narrative checks them and holds them accountable. It makes people more realistic when it comes to making risky business decisions, choosing non-traditional career paths and so forth. This argument requires you to characterise where and to whom this narrative applies. * This is a good argument, but you left yourself little to no time to make it!   05:05  Speak with more confidence! We’ve improved a lot over the past few weeks! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Ellie Fu |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the narrative that sacrifice is necessary for achieving one's dreams. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good on parental pressure - explain how this is unnecessary, isn’t needed etc. However, are these dreams? Or are these just general pressures? Note also that this doesn’t engage with what Emilia says about counter-narratives existing.  Rebuttal  You have to start by synthesising the claims from the other side. What are you responding to here?  Good on burn out - why do people prescribe to this narrative so highly that this is what happens to them? Build this out more persuasively - explain how people feel obligated to engage in sacrifice because they think it is necessary. We could characterise this as having higher stakes - so for instance how this narrative contributes to the glorification of suffering or pain in the process of achieving our goals.  Explain why the lack of truth to this narrative has bad impacts; for instance, that it misleads people or makes them blame themselves when even if they work hard and sacrifice they cannot succeed.  Argument  You need to spend time characterising the way in which this narrative impacts people in the status quo to pinpoint what the problem characterisation is. Is it that people just make bad decisions, or they glorify suffering because they think this is just part of the process?  Good example of idols - this is the level of dreams that we should be talking about. Explain how it ends up legitimising suffering - not that they do poorly, but that they were fed a lie that it would all be worth it in the end.  05:17 | | | | | | |